MEETING MINUTES
GRAND HAVEN CHARTER TOWNSHIP
PLANNING COMMISSION
FEBRUARY 20, 2023

I. CALL TO ORDER
Wilson called the meeting of the Grand Haven Charter Township Planning Commission to order at 6:01pm.

II. ROLL CALL
Members present: Wilson, Reenders, Frifeldt, Lemkuil, and Mesler
Members absent: Cousins, Hesselsweet, Wagenmaker, and Taylor
Also present: Senior Planner Thibault and Associate Planner Chaphalkar

Without objection, Wilson instructed Chaphalkar to record the minutes.

III. PLEDGE TO THE FLAG

IV. APPROVAL OF MINUTES
Without objection, the minutes of the February 6, 2023 meeting were approved.

V. CORRESPONDENCE
Casey and Mary Nash – 11479 156th Ave., West Olive
  • Expressed concerns regarding the proposed density, impact on traffic, human health, and the environment.

VI. PUBLIC COMMENTS - None

VII. PUBLIC HEARING
A. PUD – Blueberry Woods – Multifamily Apartment Complex
Wilson opened the public hearing at 6:05pm.

Thibault provided an overview through a memorandum dated February 16th.

Zach Voogt, Project Engineer from Moore & Bruggink, and David Stebbins, Vice President of Land Development for Redstone Homes were present to provide the following information:
  • Proposed development consists of multi-unit apartment buildings, two-attached housing units, and single housing units.
  • Explained reasoning for departure requests.
    o Dumpster enclosure materials – requesting vinyl fencing where wood or masonry is required due to maintenance costs.
- Roll out bins at two-unit attached homes in place of dumpster bins – will require bins to be hidden as part of HOA regulations.
- Garages are to be recessed 25% of their depth for two-unit attached homes – applicant’s floorplan does not comply but has worked well in other communities.
- Stormwater retention basin sloping – designed basin to OCWRC standards, may lessen the sloping in areas where space is available, but otherwise is designed to 3:1 or 4:1 sloping with a 6:1 safety shelf after the first few feet of depth.

Following the initial discussions, the Chair opened the public comment period:

**Elizabeth Butler – 14735 154th Avenue, Grand Haven**
- Director of Economic Development Strategic Directions for the Chamber of Commerce for Grand Haven, Spring Lake, and Ferrysburg.
- Expressed the Chamber is supportive of Blueberry Woods
- Housing provided will allow more employees to live in the Tri-Cities area, and therefore ease pressure on local employers.

**Joy Gaasch – 15195 Lakeshore Drive, Grand Haven**
- President of the Chamber of Commerce for Grand Haven, Spring Lake, and Ferrysburg.
- Expressed support of Blueberry Woods
- Provided 2021 housing study demonstrating needed housing units in the area.

**Keith Nalley – 11503 156th Ave., West Olive**
- Opposes Blueberry Woods.
- Owns property adjacent to proposed development.
- Expressed concerns regarding proposed density, impact on traffic.
- Criticized lack of public outreach for proposed development.
  - Thibault clarified that all required public notices and posting were completed.

**Luke Rykse – 11275 156th Avenue, West Olive**
- Opposes Blueberry Woods.
- Owns property adjacent to proposed development and shares an easement with an existing home to be included in the PUD.
- Expressed concerns of impact of development on character of the area.

**Jeffrey Hoek – 11375 156th Avenue, West Olive**
- Opposes Blueberry Woods.
- Owns property adjacent to proposed development and access drive.
- Questioned availability for nearby residents to receive water and sewer service as a result of the proposed development.

There being no further comments, Wilson closed the public hearing at 6:51pm.
VIII. OLD BUSINESS
A. PUD – Blueberry Woods – Multifamily Apartment Complex

The Planning Commission noted the following points of discussion:

- Considered proposed building materials, supportive of using CertainTeed panels on exterior of multi-family buildings, noting its longevity.
- Inquired about the status of the existing easement for the existing home that is to be preserved.
  - Stebbins clarified the easement will be dissolved.
- Considered the continuance of an existing accessory building to be located on a separate parcel without a home.
  - Indicated support of an agreement allowing its existence for a limited amount of time.
- Expressed support for proposed landscaping surrounding the sidewalks located near the multi-family buildings.
- Discussed proposed departures:
  - Dumpster enclosure materials may be vinyl if they match the building.
  - Roll out bins may be used at two-unit attached homes in place of dumpster bins due to HOA requirements have bins hidden.
  - Accepted the proposed garage layout, stating the intention of the ordinance language is to provide a consistent aesthetic in areas with single unit attached homes. Because the proposed development will group the two-unit attached homes, this regulation does not need to be met.
  - Direction to lessen the slope of the stormwater retention basin in areas where there is space to expand the basin.

Motion by Reenders, supported by Frifeldt, to recommend the Township Board conditionally approve the proposed multi-family residential Blueberry Woods PUD application to construct 12 multi-unit-attached buildings consisting of 224 dwelling units, 42 two-attached dwelling units in 21 buildings (duplexes), and 10 lots for single-detached dwelling units (single-family homes) of which one is existing, with a total of 276 dwelling units in Phase 1 ranging from 621-sqft to 1413-sqft in floor area. This is based on the application meeting the requirements and standards set forth by the Grand Haven Charter Township Zoning Ordinance and Master Plan. The motion is subject to, and incorporates, the following report concerning the Planned Unit Development, including conditions of approval.

REPORT – HIGH DENSITY RESIDENTIAL PLANNED UNIT DEVELOPMENT - BLUEBERRY WOODS

Pursuant to the provisions of the Grand Haven Charter Township (the “Township”) Zoning Ordinance (the “Zoning Ordinance”), the following is the report of the Grand Haven Charter Township Planning Commission.
(the “Planning Commission”) concerning an application by Redstone Land Development, LLC (the “Developer”) for approval of a Blueberry Woods Planned Unit Development (the “Project” or the “PUD”).

The Project will consist of a multi-family apartment complex. This 99.86-acre Project will be developed in (2) phases, Phase 1 totals 56.82-acres, Phase 2 totals 43.04-acres. Phase 1 will consist of 12 multi-unit-attached (multi-family) three-story buildings consisting of 224 dwelling units, 42 two-attached dwelling units in 21 one-story buildings (duplexes), and 10 lots for single-detached dwelling units (single-family homes) of which one is existing. In total 276 dwelling units are proposed. The floor areas of the 276-units range from 621-sqft to 1413-sqft. It also includes 403-surface parking spaces. It will also include 17.49ac of designated open space. Phase 2 is intended to be developed in the future as market demands. This will consist of a mix of multi-attached dwelling units (i.e. townhomes and quadplexes). The Project as recommended for approval is shown on a final site plan (the “Master Site Layout & Removals”), last revised 02/03/2023, including landscaping (the “Landscaping Layout”) last revised 02/03/23 and elevation renderings (the “Exterior Elevations”), last revised 11/07/23; collectively referred to as the “Documentation,” presently on file with the Township.

The purpose of this report is to state the decision of the Planning Commission concerning the Project, the basis for the Planning Commission’s recommendation, and the Planning Commission’s decision that the Blueberry Woods PUD be approved as outlined in this motion. The Developer shall comply with all the Documentation submitted to the Township for this Project. In granting the approval of the proposed PUD application, the Planning Commission makes the following findings pursuant to Section 17.04.3 of the Zoning Ordinance.

1. The Project meets the site plan review standards of Section 18.07 of the Zoning Ordinance. Specifically, pursuant to Section 18.07.G, the Planning Commission finds as follows:

   A. The uses proposed will not adversely affect the public health, safety, or welfare. Uses and structures located on the site shall take into account topography, size of the property, the uses on adjoining property and the relationship and size of buildings to the site. The site shall be developed so as not to impede the normal and orderly development or improvement of surrounding property for uses permitted in this Ordinance.

   B. Safe, convenient, uncontested, and well-defined vehicular and pedestrian circulation shall be provided for ingress/egress points and within the site. Drives, streets and other circulation routes shall be designed to promote safe and efficient traffic operations within the site and at ingress/egress points.

   C. The arrangement of public or private vehicular and pedestrian connections to existing or planned street in the area shall be planned to provide a safe and efficient circulation system for traffic within the Township.

   D. Removal or alteration of significant natural features shall be restricted to those areas which are reasonably necessary to develop the site in accordance with the requirements of this Ordinance. The Planning Commission may require that landscaping, buffers, and/or greenbelts be preserved and/or provided to ensure that proposed uses will be adequately buffered from one another and from surrounding public and private property.

   E. Areas of natural drainage such as swales, wetlands, ponds, or swamps shall be protected and preserved insofar as practical in their natural state to provide areas for natural habitat, preserve drainage patterns and maintain the natural characteristics of the land.

   F. The site plan shall provide reasonable visual and sound privacy for all dwelling units located therein and adjacent thereto. Fences, walls, barriers, and landscaping shall be used, as appropriate, to accomplish these purposes.

   G. All buildings and groups of buildings shall be arranged so as to permit necessary emergency vehicle access as required by the Fire/Rescue Department.
H. All streets and driveways shall be developed in accordance with the Township Subdivision Control Ordinance, the Ottawa County Road Commission, and/or Michigan Department of Transportation specifications, as appropriate, unless developed as a private road in accordance with the requirements for private roads in this Ordinance or any other Township Ordinance. Except that the Planning Commission may impose more stringent requirements than those for the Road Commission or Department of Transportation with respect to driveway location and spacing.

I. Sidewalks or pathways shall be deemed to be required along all public and private roadways unless the applicant provides compelling evidence, in the opinion of the Planning Commission, that they are not necessary for pedestrian access or safety. Sidewalks shall terminate in an appropriate fashion consistent with the needs and safety of pedestrians. No sidewalk shall terminate into landscaping.

J. Appropriate measures shall be taken to ensure that removal of surface water will not adversely affect neighboring properties of the public storm drainage system. Provisions shall be made to accommodate storm water, prevent erosion and the formation of dust. The use of detention/retention ponds may be required. Surface water on all paved areas shall be collected at intervals so that it will not obstruct the flow of vehicular or pedestrian traffic or create puddles in paved areas. Catch basins may be required to contain oil filters or traps to prevent contaminants from being discharged to the natural drainage system.

K. Exterior lighting shall be arranged so that it is deflected away from adjacent properties and so that it does not interfere with the vision of motorists along adjacent streets. Lighting of buildings or structures shall be minimized to reduce light pollution and preserve the rural character of the Township.

L. All loading and unloading areas and outside storage areas, including areas for the storage of trash, which face or are visible from residential districts of public streets, shall be screened by a vertical screen consisting of structural or plant materials no less than six (6) feet in height.

M. Entrances and exits shall be provided at appropriate locations so as to maximize the convenience and safety for persons entering or leaving the site. The number of entrances to and exits must comply with this Ordinance and the requirements of the Ottawa County Road Commission and/or the Michigan Department of Transportation.

N. Site plans shall conform to all applicable requirements of County, State, Federal, and Township statutes and ordinances. Approval may be conditioned on the applicant receiving necessary county, state, Federal, and Township permits before final site plan approval or an occupancy permit is granted.

O. Appropriate fencing may be required by the Planning Commission around the boundaries of the development if deemed necessary to minimize or prevent trespassing or other adverse effects on adjacent lands.

P. The general purposes and spirit of this Ordinance and the Master Plan of the Township shall be maintained.

2. The Planning Commission finds the Project meets the intent for a PUD, as described in Section 7.01 of the Zoning Ordinance. By approving this Project as a PUD, the Township has been able to negotiate various amenities and design characteristics as well as additional restrictions with the Developer, as described in this report, which the Township would not have been able to negotiate if the PUD Chapter of the Zoning Ordinance was not used.

3. Section 7.01.E of the Zoning Ordinance, as well as Section 503 of the Michigan Zoning Enabling Act, allow for departures from Zoning Ordinance requirements; these provisions are intended to result in land use development that is substantially consistent with the goals and objectives of the Township Master Plan and the Zoning Ordinance, and consistent with sound planning principles. The Developer requests four departures. The Planning Commission makes the following findings.
A. Section 4.02.B.1 – allow a 6-foot-high solid vinyl fence panel for the dumpster enclosure
   i. The Planning Commission finds it acceptable to allow a change in the material from what is otherwise permitted because the material proposed is of a durable nature

B. Section 12.50.F – allow the duplex units proposed to utilize roll-out bins, which shall be stored in the unit garage when not in use, in lieu of a dumpster enclosure.
   i. The Planning Commission finds it acceptable to allow roll-out bins to be used considering that duplexes in the Township have historically used these in similar developments

C. Section 4.02.A.3 – allow the stormwater system to utilize side slopes which vary between 1:3 and 1:5
   i. The Planning Commission finds it acceptable to allow a steeper side slope than what would otherwise be allowed because the primary stormwater system is a retention basin (i.e. pond) and ponds are permitted to have a side slope of 1:3. Further, the overall stormwater system has been conceptually approved by OCWRC who have final permit authority

D. Section 12.50.E – allow the duplex units to have a reduced garage setback of less than ¼ the depth of the garage
   i. The Planning Commission finds it acceptable to allow a reduction in the recess distance for the garages because the duplex units are located in an area planned for high density residential structures, not located within an area characterized by single unit detached homes.

4. Section 8.09 of the Zoning Ordinance allows for the Planning Commission to provide a waiver from the required access point separation distance if and only if MDOT and/or OCRC likewise grant a waiver from their standards. The Planning Commission recognizes that the proposed access connections, while not meeting the requirements of the Zoning Ordinance, are suitable and are prepared to waive this requirement pending final approval of the design by the authority who has jurisdiction.

5. Section 4.02.A.4.D of the Zoning Ordinance allows for the Planning Commission to provide a waiver from the parking lot curb requirements if the parking lot is designed to function with the stormwater system and/or allow efficient snow removal. The Planning Commission finds that the parking lot design is acceptable and the wheel stops are effective as to limit the vehicles from adversely impacting the stormwater system.

6. Compared to what could have been constructed by right, the Project has been designed to accomplish the following objectives from Section 7.01.D of the Zoning Ordinance.
   A. To encourage the use of land in accordance with its natural character and adaptability;
   B. To promote the conservation of natural features and resources;
   C. To encourage innovation in land use planning and development;
   D. To promote the enhancement of housing, commercial and industrial employment, traffic circulation, and recreational opportunities for area residents;
   E. To promote and ensure greater compatibility of design and better use between neighboring properties;
   F. To promote more economical and efficient use of the land while providing harmonious variety of housing choices and the integration of necessary commercial and community facilities; and
   G. To promote the preservation of open space for parks, recreation, or agriculture.

7. The Project meets the following qualification requirements of Section 7.02 of the Zoning Ordinance:
   A. The Project meets the minimum size of five acres of contiguous land.
B. The proposed PUD is a “Large Scale Development” (see Section 14.01) that includes eight (8) or more dwelling units, which include multi-family apartment units.

8. The Planning Commission also finds the Project complies with the general PUD Design Considerations of Section 7.08 of the Zoning Ordinance.

9. The Planning Commission finds that the Project complies with the uses permitted for a residential planned unit development, as described in Section 7.04 of the Zoning Ordinance—Residential PUD.

10. The Planning Commission also finds the Project shall comply with the below additional conditions as allowed for in Section 18.08 of the Zoning Ordinance.

   A. The open space must be set aside by means of conveyance that satisfies the requirements of Section 7.10.F of the Zoning Ordinance. Said conveyance shall be submitted to the Township for review and approval by the Township Attorney and recorded with the Ottawa County Register of Deeds prior to obtaining an occupancy permit.

   B. Must obtain permits from all applicable agencies including, the State of Michigan, the Ottawa County Road Commission, and Ottawa County Water Resources Commissioner. Permits shall be obtained before building permits are issued.

   C. The Developer shall enter into a PUD Contract with the Township, which will be drafted by the Township Attorney and executed by the Township Board prior to receiving an occupancy permit.

   D. The Developer shall come into compliance with respect to the outstanding items as described in the Staff Review Memo dated 02/16/23, which is inclusive of the following Sections in the Zoning Ordinance:

      1. (18.07.B) Provide conceptual approval from EGLE
      2. (6.07) Provide calculation of average level for sum of all impervious surface area
      3. (7.04E, 7.10) Provide a clarified exhibit drawing, describing the following areas in order for the open space to be calculated correctly.
         i. Area of regulated wetlands in Phase 1
         ii. Total area of contiguous greenspace that is at least 7500sf in area and 100-feet wide (Smallest buildable lot)
         iii. Area of required stormwater detention/retention per OCWRC
         iv. Total area of Phase 1 not including public ROW easements
      4. (7.08.B.6.b) Provide finalized locations and complaint screening.
      5. (7.06.B.6.h) Provide revised apartment and duplex planting plans
      6. (7.10.B.1) Provide fence details for community garden, if applicable
      7. (4.02.A.4.a) Provide revised landscape plan for parking lot areas
      8. (4.02.B.9) Provide revised landscape schedule
      9. (5.05) Provide revised site plan showing ADA spaces
     10. (2.08) Provide revised site plan with a complaint width for Lot 4
     11. (2.08.M) Provide revised lot access for Lot 10

   E. This approval is also conditioned upon the Developer meeting all applicable Federal, State, County, and Township laws, rules, and ordinances.
F. The Developer shall comply with all the requirements of the Documentation, specifically including all the notes contained thereon, and all the representations made in the written submissions by the Developer to the Township for consideration of the Project.

G. In the event of a conflict between the Documentation and these conditions, these conditions shall control.

IX. NEW BUSINESS

A. Pre-Application – Christian Reformed Conference Grounds – Site Improvements

Chaphalkar provided an overview through a memorandum dated February 16th.

Michael Perton, the Executive Director for Christian Reformed Conference Grounds was present to provide the following information:

- Explained proposed site improvements:
  - Remove four campsites and replace with two 1600 sqft cottage buildings; reconfigure the existing tennis courts to add pickleball courts.
  - Construct a new 9,160sqft ministry center, which will replace the existing store, kitchen, registration and meeting center.
  - Construct a 20,000sqft “Cottage Suites” building.
  - Construct previously approved bathhouse expansion.
- Confirmed overall density and building area will decrease from approved CRCG Master Plan.
- Informed Commissioners about ongoing discussions with Department of Public Works for sewer service within the site.

The Planning Commission noted the following points of discussion:

- Noted prior concerns from adjacent property owners for noise and parking.
- Inquired into the extent of the bathhouse expansion
- Sought clarification on approval process and lodging use.
  - Chaphalkar confirmed the improvements are to be reviewed under the site plan review process per compliance with the 1991 consent judgement.

X. REPORTS

A. Staff Report - None

B. Commissioner Comments

- Commissioners discussed the Blueberry Woods site, noting the use is in compliance with the Master Plan and meets the intent of how and where high density housing should occur.

XI. EXTENDED PUBLIC COMMENTS - None

XII. ADJOURNMENT

Without objection, the meeting adjourned at 7:59 p.m.
Respectfully submitted,

Cassandra Chaphalkar
Acting Recording Secretary